

**MINUTES**  
**ALABAMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS BOARD**  
**RSA UNION STREET**  
**SUITE 370**  
**MONTGOMERY, ALABAMA**  
**November 15, 2012**

**MEMBERS PRESENT:**

Mr. Kenneth D. Wallis, III (Chairman)  
Mrs. Dot Wood (Vice-Chairman)  
Mr. Mark Moody  
Mr. Christopher Baker  
Mr. Joseph Lundy  
Mr. Fred Crochen (arrived at 8:25)  
Mrs. Cornelia Tisher  
Mr. Chester Mallory  
Mr. Dennis Key

**MEMBERS ABSENT:**

None

**OTHERS PRESENT:**

Mrs. Lisa Brooks, Executive Director  
Ms. Neva Conway, Legal Counsel  
Mrs. Carolyn Greene, Executive Secretary  
Mr. Sam Davis, Investigator

**GUESTS PRESENT:**

None

- 1.0 With quorum present Mr. Kenneth Wallis, Chairman, called the meeting to order at 8:20 a.m. Mrs. Carolyn Greene, Executive Secretary, recorded the minutes. The meeting was held in the 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor Conference Room, 100 North Union Street, Montgomery, Alabama. Prior notice of the meeting was posted on the Secretary of State's website on February 6, 2012 in accordance with the Alabama Open Meetings Act.
- 2.0 The meeting was opened with prayer by Mr. Lundy and followed by the Pledge of Allegiance, led by Mr. Wallis.
- 3.0 Members present were Mr. Kenneth Wallis, III, Mrs. Dot Wood, Mr. Joseph Lundy, Mr. Fred Crochen, Mrs. Cornelia Tisher, Mr. Mark Moody, Mr. Chris Baker, Mr. Dennis Key and Mr. Chester Mallory.
- 4.0 On motion by Mr. Lundy and second by Mr. Mallory, the regular minutes for September 20, 2012 were approved as written. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

- 5.0 Ms. Conway included the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and Recommendation from Administrative Law Judge Algert S. Agricola, Jr., in Complaint No. AB-10-39 (George W. Whiting, Jr., R00556). With Mr. Lundy recusing, on motion by Mr. Baker and second by Mr. Moody, the Board voted to adopt the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law and Recommendation as written as the Order of the Board. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

Ms. Conway included, for Board information, the Certificate of Judgment in Alabama Real Estate Appraisers Board v. Joshua M. Smith. The Alabama Court of Civil Appeals reversed the Circuit Court of Randolph County and remanded the case to the Circuit Court to reinstate the Board's discipline.

- 6.0 Ms. Conway discussed amending the Administrative Code for Probable Cause Findings for AMC cases. On motion by Mr. Key and second by Mr. Baker, the Board voted to amend the Administrative Code to allow the Executive Director and the Board's Attorney to find Probable Cause against Appraisal Management Companies and to rewrite the terms of the Surety Bond to extend it for 6 months beyond the expiration date of registration. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board asked Ms. Conway to research adding language to the law requiring background checks on all applicants for licensure and to draft an amendment for the 2013 regular session of the Legislature.

On motion by Mr. Wallis and second by Mr. Lundy, the Board voted to amend the Administrative Code to require licensees to notify the Board immediately upon changes to their email addresses.

- 7.0 On motion by Mr. Lundy and second by Mr. Baker the following applications were voted on as listed. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

- 7.1 **Trainee Real Property Appraiser applications approved:** Don P. Bozeman, Whitney Michelle Clark, Lauren M. McGarry, Tamala K. Nelson, Leah Marie Partridge, Edgar Lee Suttles and Stephanie Michelle Truett. **Applications deferred:** None. **Applications denied:** None.

**Trainee Real Property Appraiser Experience Logs for Review: Logs approved:** Randy Mink. **Logs deferred:** Kim Chalmers, Jason Easter, Rachel Greene, Kevin A. Haefner, David Ikard, Cynthia Kelley, Edgar Reeves and Andrew Wilcoxon. **Log denied:** Thomas F. Bradley.

- 7.2 **State Registered Real Property Appraiser applications approved:** None. **Application deferred:** Kevin A. Haefner. **Application denied:** Thomas F. Bradley.

- 7.3 **Licensed Real Property Appraiser applications approved:** Jim Ed Anderson, Jr. (Recip.)(GA), Amberly A. Bullock (Recip.)(GA) and Carrie J. Salituro (Recip.)(GA). **Application deferred:** Edgar Reeves.

**Applications denied:** None.

7.4 **Certified Residential Real Property Appraiser applications approved:** Russell Bagwell, Donald G. Bell (Recip.)(GA), Alan Lloyd Daniel (Recip.)(TN), Windy Dobbs, Randy Mink, Robert Roy Swank (Recip.)(GA), and J. W. Weatherly. **Application deferred:** Andrew Wilcoxon. **Applications denied:** None.

7.5 **Certified General Real Property Appraiser applications approved:** Michael David Barrow (Recip.)(GA), Karen Lynn Blosser (Recip.)(OH), Rodney G. Clough (Recip.)(CO), Shelita Knight Compton (Recip.)(GA), Adam Joseph Hardej (Recip.)(MA), Mark Joseph Holmes (Recip.)(FL), Vincent Jackson Howell, Elizabeth A. Malone (Recip.)(GA), Steven L. McNair (Recip.)(MS), Matt H. Moorefield (Recip.)(GA), Marc George Nassif (Recip.)(MI), Billy Scott Richards (Recip.)(GA), Stewart Shaw Stafford (Recip.)(MS), David William Thibodeau (Recip.)(GA) and Jeffrey Howard Walker (Recip.)(OH). **Application deferred:** Phillip Parmer. **Applications denied:** None.

7.6 **Mentor applications approved:** Chad Anderson. **Applications deferred:** John Bach, Alan Daniel and Chris Copeland. **Applications denied:** None.

8.0 Mr. Lundy presented the Finance report and stated that, at the end of Fiscal Year 2012, the Board was 69% into budget expenditures; and at 8% into Fiscal Year 2013 the Board was 11% into budget expenditures. Mr. Lundy stated that there were no negative trends that could not be reconciled at this time.

Mr. Lundy told the Board that he would report on the RSA Union lease and information on other office space possibilities at the January Board meeting.

On motion by Mr. Baker and second by Mr. Mallory, the Board voted to approve the Financial Report. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Investment report was included for Board information.

9.0 On motion by Mr. Crochen and second by Mr. Baker, the following education courses and instructor recommendations were approved, deferred, or denied as indicated. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

### **APPRAISAL INSTITUTE – NATIONAL CHAPTER**

#### **Renewal Applications:**

(CE) Advanced Spreadsheet Modeling for Valuation Applications – 14 hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Jim Amarin)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

- (CE) 2012-2013 7 hour National USPAP Update Course – 7 hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Thomas Kirby)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) 2012-2013 7 hour National USPAP Update Equivalent Course – 7 hours – Online  
(Instructor: Craig Harrington)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Advanced Internet Search Strategies – 7 hours – Online  
(Instructor: Jim Amarin)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Analyzing Distressed Real Estate – 4 hours – Online  
(Instructor: William Anglyn)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Analyzing Operating Expenses – 7 hours – Online  
(Instructor: William Anglyn)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Appraisal Curriculum Overview-General – 7 hours – Online  
(Instructor: Mark Rattermann)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Appraisal Curriculum Overview-Residential – 8 hours – Online  
(Instructor: Mark Rattermann)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Appraising Convenience Stores – 7 hours – Online  
(Instructor: Robert Bainbridge)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Appraising Manufactured Housing – 7 hours – Online  
(Instructor: Richard Heyn)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Appraising the Appraisal: Appraisal Review-Residential – 7 hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Craig Harrington)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Business Practice and Ethics – 5 hours – Online  
(Instructor: J. Carl Schultz)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Condominiums, Co-op's & PUD's – 7 hours – Online  
(Instructor: Alan Simmons)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

- (CE) Data Verification Methods – 5 hours – Online  
(Instructor: Alan Simmons)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Eminent Domain & Condemnation – 7 hours – Online  
(Instructor: John Underwood)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Feasibility, Market, Value, Investment Timing: Option Value – 7 hours – Online  
(Instructor: Kenneth Lusht)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Forecasting Revenue – 7 hours – Online  
(Instructor: William Anglyn)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Fundamentals of Separating Real Property, Personal Property & Intangible Business Assets – 15 hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: David Lennhoff)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Introduction to Green Buildings: Principles & Concepts – 8 hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Taylor Watkins)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Litigation Appraising: Specialized Topics & Applications – 15 hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Stephen Roach)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Marketability Studies: The Six-Step Process & Basic Applications – 7 hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Richard Parli)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Practical Regression Using Microsoft Excel – 14 hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: John Urubeck)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Rates & Ratios: Making Sense of GIMS, OARS & DCF – 7 hours – Online  
(Instructor: Kenneth Lusht)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Residential Applications: Using Technology to Measure & Support – 7 hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: James Atwood)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

- (CE) Reviewing Residential Appraisals & Using Fannie Mae Form 2000 – 7 hours – Online  
(Instructor: Mark Ratterman)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Subdivision Valuation – 7 hours – Online  
(Instructor: Don Emerson)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) The FHA & The Appraisal Process – 7 hours – Online  
(Instructor: Craig Harrington)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Uniform Appraisal Dataset Aftereffects: Efficiency vs. Obligation – 7 hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Dawn Gennrich)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Thinking Outside the Form – 7 hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Jim Atwood)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Uniform Appraisal Standards for Federal Land Acquisition – 16 hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Stephen Roach)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Valuation in Challenging Markets – 28 hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Stephen Roach)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) What Commercial Clients Would Like Appraisers to Know: How to Meet Their Expectations – 7 hours – Online  
(Instructor: Jim Amorin)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) 2012-2013 Online 15 Hour National USPAP Equivalent Course – 15 hours – Online  
(Instructor: Tom Kirby)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) 2012-2013 Online 15 Hour National USPAP Course – 15 hours – Online  
(Instructor: Tom Kirby)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) Advanced Income Capitalization – 33 hours – Classroom  
(Instructors: Harry Holzhauer and Steven Roach)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

- (LIC) Advanced Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use – 33 hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Robert Dunham)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) Alternative Uses and Cost Valuation of Small, Mixed Use Properties – 16 hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Vincent Dowling)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) Apartment Appraisal: Concepts and Applications – 16 hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Vincent Dowling)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) Apartment Appraisal: Concepts and Applications – 16 hours – Online  
(Instructor: Kenneth Foltz)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) Basic Appraisal Principles – 30 hours – Online  
(Instructor: Richard Dubay)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) Basic Appraisal Procedures – 30 hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Craig Harrington)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) Basic Appraisal Procedures – 30 hours – Online  
(Instructor: Thomas Kirby)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) General Appraiser Income Approach Part 1 – 30 hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Gary Taylor)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) General Appraiser Income Approach Part 2 – 30 hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Gary Taylor)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) General Appraiser Income Approach Part 2 – 30 hours – Online  
(Instructor: David Lennhoff)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) General Appraiser Report Writing & Case Studies – 30 hours – Online  
(Instructor: Richard Dubay)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

- (LIC) General Appraiser Report Writing & Case Studies – 30 hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Richard Dubay)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) General Appraiser Sales Comparison Approach – 30 hours – Online  
(Instructor: Kenneth Foltz)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) General Appraiser Sales Comparison Approach – 30 hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Thomas Kirby)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) General Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach – 30 hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Harry Holzhauer)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) Income Valuation of Small, Mixed-Use Properties – 16 hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Vincent Dowling)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) Quantitative Analysis – 33 hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Kenneth Foltz)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) Real Estate Finance, Statistics & Valuation Modeling – 15 hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Kenneth Lusht)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) Real Estate Finance, Statistics & Valuation Modeling – 15 hours – Online  
(Instructor: Kenneth Lusht)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) Residential Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use – 15 hours – Online  
(Instructor: Sara Schwarzentraub)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) Residential Report Writing and Case Studies – 15 hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Alan Blankenship)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) Residential Sales Comparison and Income Approach – 15 hours – Classroom

(Instructor: Mark Rattermann)

**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

(LIC) Residential Site Valuation and Cost Approach – 15 hours – Classroom

(Instructor: John Urubek)

**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

(LIC) Sales Comparison Valuation of Small Mixed-Use Properties – 16 hours – Classroom

(Instructor: Vincent Dowling)

**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

### **APPRAISAL UNIVERSITY**

#### **Renewal Applications:**

(CE) Appraising Historic Property - 7 Hours – Online

(Instructor: Steven Spangle)

**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

(CE) Practices and Pitfalls for the Residential Appraiser - 9 Hours – Online

(Instructor: Bill Pastuszek)

**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

(CE) Retail Center Analysis for Financing - 7 Hours – Online

(Instructor: Bruce Coin)

**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

(CE) 2012-2013 7 Hour Equivalent USPAP Update Course - 7 Hours – Online

(Instructor: Timothy Detty)

**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

(CE) Site Analysis and Valuation - 7 Hours – Online

(Instructor: Steven Spangle)

**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

### **EARTH ADVANTAGE INSTITUTE**

#### **Renewal Application:**

(CE) Appraising Green Homes - 14 Hours – Classroom

(Instructor: Taylor Watkins)

**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

### **GEORGIA MLS TRAINING INSTITUTE**

#### **New Applications:**

(CE) Covering All the Bases in Residential Reporting - 7 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Wade Gaddy)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

(CE) Foreclosure Basics for Appraisers - 7 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Wade Gaddy)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

### **MCKISSOCK, LP**

#### **New Applications:**

(CE) Land and Site Valuation-Live Webinar – 5 Hours – Online  
(Instructors: Daniel Bradley, Tracy Martin and Charles Huntoon)  
**Both Course and Instructors Approved**

(CE) Disciplinary Cases- What NOT to do (Live Webinar) – 7 Hours – Online  
(Instructors: Daniel Bradley, Tracy Martin and Charles Huntoon)  
**Both Course and Instructors Approved**

(CE) FHA for Today's Appraiser – 7 Hours – Classroom  
(Instructors: Dan Bradley, Wally Czekalski, Ken Guilfoyle, Chuck Huntoon, Tracy Martin, Richard McKissock, Larry McMillen, Steve Vehmeier, John Willey, Susanne Barkalow and Paul Lorenzen)  
**Both Course and Instructors Approved**

### **UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH ALABAMA CENTER FOR REAL ESTATE STUDIES**

#### **Renewal Applications:**

(CE) Commercial Real Estate and Market Review – 7 Hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Donald Epley)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

(CE) Coastal Economic Outlook – 3 Hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Donald Epley)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

10.0 The Board reviewed the following disciplinary reports.

**AB 10-61, AB 10-62, AB 10-63, AB 10-64** On September 20, 2012, the Board adopted the recommendations of the Administrative Law Judge and suspended the license of Cleabron Pullum for six (6) months. Pullum also must attend training on safeguarding his electronic signature and USPAP.. The violations are: Respondent failed to use due care to safeguard his electronic signature. Respondent communicated a misleading report, did not use recognized methods and techniques in the development of the report, failed to analyze all information necessary for

credible assignment results in the preparation of the Sales Comparison Approach and communicated the analysis and opinions in a misleading manner. **Violation: Standards Ethics Rule-Conduct, Rule 1-1(a), 1-1(b), 1-1(c), 1-4(a), 2-1(a), 2-1(d), USPAP 2010-2011 Edition.**

**AB 11-32** On September 20, 2012, the Board approved a Consent Settlement Order for a private reprimand of a Certified Residential appraiser. Licensee agreed to pay an administrative fine of \$1500. The violations are: The Licensee certified that he conducted interior and exterior inspections of the subject and did not. Licensee relied on the measurements made by the Trainee appraiser, which were incorrect. This resulted in an understatement of the GLA of the subject by approximately 250 square feet. Licensee reported the subject property was rectangular when it was irregular, that there was an in ground pool when there was not, that the driveway was gravel when it was concrete, that there was 1,183 square feet of basement when there was none. **Violation: Ethics Rule-Conduct, Standards Rule 1-1(b): 1-1(c); 2-1(c), USPAP 2010-2011 Edition.**

**AB 11-43** On September 20, 2012, the Board approved a Consent Settlement Order and ordered a private reprimand to a certified residential appraiser. Licensee must also pay a \$250 administrative fine and attend a 7-hour USPAP course within 30 days. The USPAP course cannot be counted for Continuing Education purposes. These violations are as follows: Licensee made substantial location adjustments for floor location in this condominium appraisal. While an adjustment is indicated from the sales data, licensee adjusted inconsistently for comps located in the same condominium and provided no data to back up the adjustments in the work file. **Violation: Standard Rules 1-4(a), 2-1(a), USPAP 2006 Edition.**

**AB 11-51** On September 20, 2012, the Board approved a Consent Settlement Order suspending the license of Gail D. Carnes, Certified Residential appraiser R00057 for three (3) months. Two months of the suspension are stayed. Licensee must pay an administrative fine of \$1650. The violations are: Licensee communicated a misleading appraisal. There were so many errors in the development of the Sales Comparison and Cost Approach that the value opinion was not credible. Licensee failed to perform the necessary research for the appraisal to be credible. Licensee failed to retain a "true copy" of the appraisal report in the work file. Licensee's copy of the appraisal report was not a "true copy" of the appraisal report on file with the lender/client. The workshop and greenhouses were not analyzed as part of the amenities in the Cost or Sales approaches. The sale/transfer history of the Subject and comparables was verified using outdated data (*Appraisal dated April 2008 and data source date dated September 2007*). The Cost Approach was developed with outdated cost data (*Appraisal dated April, 2008 and cost data current as of September 2007*). The front porch was not included in the Cost Approach. Physical depreciation was inaccurate because it was

calculated from values where Licensee had made the significant errors, including those listed above. Licensee did not consider that the comparables were located in areas superior to the Subject. Licensee did not consider the inferior view of the subject. Quality of construction contained a description of the exterior siding instead of an analysis of the quality. Licensee did not consider Comparable #3's full unfinished basement. Licensee failed to develop a credible opinion of site value with appropriate method and technique and supported data in the Cost Approach. The Cost Approach was developed with outdated cost data (*Appraisal dated April, 2008 and cost data current as of September 2007*). The front porch was not included in the Cost Approach. The physical depreciation was based on a non-credible effective age and an estimate of cost new that was non credible. In the Neighborhood/Built Up section of the report, Licensee indicated the build up was 25%-75%, which was not consistent with the percentage reported in the Neighborhood/Percent Land Use % section. The neighborhood is described as an area of north central Alabama and not a description of the subject neighborhood. Site/Area is inaccurate. Zoning is reported as Residential and legal when the Subject is located in an area of the County that does not have zoning regulations. Licensee did not report that a portion of the site is within a FEMA special flood hazard area. Licensee described remodeling as completed when the workfile does not support that the work was finished. A comment on a photograph of the den explains that remodeling is in progress with workers present at the time of the inspection. The volume of properties offered for sale and comparables sales were misrepresented. The address of Comparable #2 is incorrect. The date of sale for Comparable #4 is incorrect. Licensee stated the pending date and not the sold date. In the Sale/Transfer History section, prior sales/transfers are indicated and in the sales grid Licensee states there were no sales/transfers of the subject. Real estate taxes and special assessments are reported as unknown and the census tract as n/a. The predominant price of homes in the neighborhood is reported as \$125,000 and the value opinion for Subject is \$170,000. There is no analysis to indicate Licensee considered that the Subject was overbuilt. Effective age is reported as 2 years for a 37-year-old structure. There is not support in the report for the effective age. The Photograph Addendum contained MLS photos without disclosing that fact. Licensee omitted the workshop, greenhouses and 2-car storage area from the building sketch. Licensee failed to state the reason for the exclusion of the Income Approach. **Violation: Ethics Rule-Conduct; Ethics Rule-Record Keeping; Standards Rule 1-1(a); 1-1(b); 1-4(a); 1-4(b)(i); 1-4(b)(ii); 1-4(b)(iii); 2-1(a); 2-1(b); 2-2(b)(v)(iii); USPAP 2008-2009 Edition.**

Ms. Conway discussed with the Board the investigative status charts. Ms. Conway informed the Board 18 new complaints were received since the September 2012 Board meeting, 12 complaints were dismissed, and 8 complaints were settled, leaving a total of 72 open complaints.

11.0

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-12-02**: With Mrs. Wood and Mr. Wallis recusing, on motion by Mr. Key and second by Mr. Baker, the Board voted to accept the Disciplinary Committee's recommendation that probable cause does not exist and to dismiss this case. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-12-03**: With Mrs. Tisher and Mr. Baker recusing, on motion by Mr. Key and second by Mr. Mallory, the Board voted to accept the Disciplinary Committee's recommendation that probable cause does not exist and to dismiss this case. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-12-05**: With Mr. Wallis and Mr. Baker recusing, on motion by Mr. Lundy and second by Mr. Key, the Board voted to accept the Disciplinary Committee's recommendation that probable cause does exist and to set this case for hearing. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-12-12**: With Mr. Baker and Mr. Lundy recusing, on motion by Mr. Mallory and second by Mrs. Tisher, the Board voted to accept the Disciplinary Committee's recommendation that probable cause does not exist and to dismiss this case. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-12-19**: With Mrs. Wood recusing, on motion by Mrs. Tisher and second by Mr. Moody, the Board voted to accept the Disciplinary Committee's recommendation that probable cause does not exist and to dismiss this case. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-12-21**: With Mrs. Wood recusing, on motion by Mr. Mallory and second by Mr. Baker, the Board voted to accept the Disciplinary Committee's recommendation that probable cause does not exist and to dismiss this case. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-12-24**: With Mr. Key recusing, on motion by Mr. Lundy and second by Mrs. Tisher, the Board voted to accept the Disciplinary Committee's recommendation that probable cause does not exist and to dismiss this case. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-12-34**: With Mrs. Wood recusing, on motion by Mr. Lundy and second by Mr. Baker, the Board voted to accept the Disciplinary Committee's recommendation that probable cause does exist and to set this case for hearing. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-12-38**: With Mr. Key recusing, on motion by Mr. Mallory and second by Mr. Baker, the Board voted to accept the Disciplinary Committee's recommendation that

probable cause does not exist and to dismiss this case. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-12-41**: With Mr. Baker and Mrs. Wood recusing, on motion by Mr. Moody and second by Mr. Lundy, the Board voted to accept the Disciplinary Committee's recommendation that probable cause does not exist and to dismiss this case. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-12-42**: With Mrs. Wood recusing, on motion by Mr. Lundy and second by Mr. Baker, the Board voted to accept the Disciplinary Committee's recommendation that probable cause does not exist and to dismiss this case. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-12-43**: With Mr. Key recusing, on motion by Mr. Mallory and second by Mrs. Tisher, the Board voted to accept the Disciplinary Committee's recommendation that probable cause does not exist and to dismiss this case. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AMC-12-1**: On motion by Mr. Baker and second by Mr. Key, the Board voted to accept the Disciplinary Committee's recommendation that probable cause does exist and to set this case for hearing. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AMC-12-2**: On motion by Mrs. Tisher and second by Mr. Key, the Board voted to accept the Disciplinary Committee's recommendation that probable cause does exist and to set this case for hearing. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AMC-12-3**: On motion by Mr. Key and second by Mr. Mallory, the Board voted to accept the Disciplinary Committee's recommendation that probable cause does exist and to set this case for hearing. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AMC-12-5**: On motion by Mr. Mallory and second by Mr. Moody, the Board voted to accept the Disciplinary Committee's recommendation that probable cause does exist and to set this case for hearing. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

12.0 The Board reviewed Consent Settlement Order on **AB-11-45, AB-11-46 and AB-11-47 (Kellie Jones Ross, R00961)**. With Mrs. Wood recusing, on motion by Mr. Mallory and second by Mr. Baker, the Board voted to approve this Consent Settlement Order. Mr. Lundy opposed the motion. Motion carried.

The Board reviewed Consent Settlement Order on **AB-11-34 (Sean R. Tomlinson, R00264)**. With Mrs. Wood recusing, on motion by Mrs. Tisher and second by Mr. Crochen, the Board voted to approve this Consent Settlement Order. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

- 13.0 The following reciprocal licenses were issued since last meeting: Jim Ed Anderson, Jr. (Recip.)(GA), Michael David Barrow (Recip.)(GA), Donald G. Bell (Recip.)(GA), Karen Lynn Blosser (Recip.)(OH), Amberly A. Bullock (Recip.)(GA), Rodney G. Clough (Recip.)(CO), Shelita Knight Compton (Recip.)(GA), Alan Lloyd Daniel (Recip.)(TN), Adam Joseph Hardej (Recip.)(MA), Mark Joseph Holmes (Recip.)(FL), Elizabeth A. Malone (Recip.)(GA), Steven L. McNair (Recip.)(MS), Matt H. Moorefield, (Recip.)(GA), Marc George Nassif (Recip.)(MI), Billy Scott Richards (Recip.)(GA), Carrie J. Salituro (Recip.)(GA), Stewart Shaw Stafford (Recip.)(MS), Robert Roy Swank (Recip.)(GA), David William Thibodeau (Recip.)(GA) and Jeffrey Howard Walker (Recip.)(GA).
- 14.0 The Temporary Permit report was provided to the Board for their information.
- 15.0 The Appraisal Management report was provided to the Board for their information.
- 16.0 Mrs. Brooks discussed the following:
- Renewal report for Board information. Mrs. Brooks informed the Board that as of November 14, 2012, 1443 of the Licensees have renewed of which 1180 or 76% were online renewals.
  - Mrs. Brooks informed the Board that the Examiners of Public Accounts Board Member Training would be held January 23, 2012 and urged all Board members to attend. The date of the January, 2013 Board meeting will be changed to January 24, 2013 so that Board members can attend the Board Member Training.
  - An email from Mrs. Carla Nelson, requesting an extension for renewing her license which closed after two consecutive non-renewals. On motion by Mr. Baker and second by Mr. Lundy, the Board voted to deny the request. Motion carried by unanimous vote.
  - An email from Mr. Lyonell Pugh, requesting an extension for renewing his license which closed after two consecutive non-renewals. On motion by Mr. Baker and second by Mrs. Tisher, the Board voted to deny the request. Motion carried by unanimous vote.
  - An email from Ms. Patricia Callahan, requesting a waiver of the renewal late fee. On motion by Mr. Baker and second by Mr. Lundy, the Board voted to deny the request. Motion carried by unanimous vote.
  - A letter from Mr. Brent Hider, requesting an official position from the Board on the use of foreclosure and short sales. The Board

asked Mrs. Tisher to call Mr. Hider with an explanation.

- The Appraisal Subcommittee Compliance Review letter for Board information.

17.0 The Board discussed a letter from Mr. David Green, CFO, MountainSeed Advisors, LLC, requesting the opinion of the Board regarding commercial valuations. After discussion, on motion by Mr. Lundy and second by Mr. Baker, the Board voted that only appraisers could give a value unless it is in conjunction with a listing. Anyone else rendering a value violates Alabama law.

Mrs. Brooks discussed an experience point request from Ms. Laura Burnett. Mrs. Tisher suggested that Ms. Burnett be awarded one extra point for each appraisal submitted for review, or two total points per appraisal, of which she would receive half of the total points as a Trainee.

18.0 There was no new business to discuss at this time.

19.0 At 11:07 a.m., on motion by Mr. Lundy and second by Mr. Baker, the Board voted to adjourn. Motion carried by unanimous vote. The Board's tentative meeting schedule for 2013 is January 24, 2013, March 21, 2013, May 16, 2013, July 18, 2013, September 19, 2013 and November 21, 2013 in the 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor Conference Room of the RSA Union Building, 100 North Union Street, Montgomery, Alabama.

Sincerely,

Carolyn Greene  
Executive Secretary

**APPROVED:** \_\_\_\_\_  
**Kenneth Wallis, III, Chairman**