

**MINUTES**  
**ALABAMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS BOARD**  
**RSA UNION STREET**  
**SUITE 370**  
**MONTGOMERY, AL 36104**  
**July 13, 2023**

**MEMBERS PRESENT:**

Mr. Chad Anderson (Vice-Chairman)  
Mr. Billy Cotter  
Mr. Mark Haller  
Mrs. Melanie Housh  
Mr. Robert Butler  
Mr. Drew Watson

**MEMBERS ABSENT:**

Mr. Roger Ball (Chairman)  
Mr. Richard D. Pettey

**STAFF PRESENT:**

Mrs. Lisa Brooks, Executive Director  
Ms. Neva Conway, Legal Counsel  
Mrs. Carolyn Greene, Executive Secretary  
Mr. Jimmy Green, Investigator  
Mr. Sam Davis, Investigator

**GUESTS PRESENT:**

Mr. Thomas Chapman, Trainee, Orange Beach  
Mr. Walker Watson

- 1.0 Mr. Chad Anderson, Vice-Chairman, called the meeting to order at 9:18 a.m. Mrs. Carolyn Greene, Executive Secretary, recorded the minutes. The meeting was held in the Suite 300 Conference Room of the RSA Union Building, 100 N. Union Street, Montgomery, Alabama. Prior notice of the meeting was posted on the Secretary of State's website on December 6, 2022, and revised on May 18, 2023, in accordance with the Alabama Open Meetings Act.
- 2.0 The meeting was opened with prayer led by Mr. Haller and the Pledge of Allegiance, led by Mr. Butler.

3.0 Mr. Anderson asked Mrs. Greene to call a voice roll to establish a quorum. Board members present were Mr. Anderson, Mr. Mark Haller, Mr. Robert Butler, Mr. Drew Watson, Mr. Billy Cotter, and Mrs. Melanie Housh. Members absent were Mr. Roger Ball and Mr. Rick Pettey. A quorum was established.

Mr. Anderson welcomed the guests and asked them to introduce themselves.

4.0 On motion by Mr. Cotter and second by Mr. Haller, the regular minutes for May 18, 2023, were approved as written. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

At this time, Ms. Conway opened nominations for the Chairman position. Mr. Haller nominated Mr. Anderson for Chairman. Mr. Cotter seconded the motion. Hearing no further nominations, Ms. Conway closed the nominations and called for a vote for Chairman. The Board voted to elect Mr. Anderson as Chairman by unanimous vote.

Ms. Conway next opened nominations for the Vice-Chairman. Mr. Anderson nominated Mrs. Housh for Vice-Chairman. Mr. Cotter seconded the motion. Hearing no further nominations, Ms. Conway closed the nominations and called for a vote for Vice-Chairman. The Board voted to elect Mrs. Housh as Vice-Chairman by unanimous vote.

5.0 Ms. Conway informed the Board that a hearing in the case of AB-21-22, (Sean Hollis, R00701) is scheduled for September 21, 2023 before the Board, and that there was no other Pending Litigation to discuss.

6.0 Ms. Conway gave the Legislative Report and reported that the Legislature is going into Special Session on July 17<sup>th</sup> for the purpose of redistricting.

7.0 On motion by Mr. Haller and second by Mrs. Housh, with Mr. Butler abstaining, the following applications were voted on as listed. Motion carried.

On motion by Mr. Haller and second by Mrs. Housh, the Board voted to review new samples when an application is submitted on any applicant who had previous issues noted in a review or application. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

7.1 **Trainee Real Property Appraiser applications approved:** Agee S. Broughton, IV, Thomas Hang, John Howard Haynie, Bobby Ozbirn, Olivia Shea Pope, Steven R. Richardson, Jennifer Jarmin Smith and Travis Douglas Walden. **Applications approved:** None. **Applications denied:** None.

**Trainee Real Property Appraiser Experience Logs for Review:** **Logs approved:** Andrew Bolin, Thomas Chapman, Jeremy Collins, Emily Deason, Ashton Fowler, Isaac T. Gordy, Austin Grace, John Alexander Hutto, Trevor Zane Lambert and Kellie Summerlin. **Log Reviews deferred:** James Baker, Grant Dickey, and Ronald Curtis Vaughn. **Log Reviews denied:** None.

- 7.2 **State Registered Real Property Appraiser** applications approved: None. **Applications deferred:** None. **Applications denied:** None.
- 7.3 **Licensed Real Property Appraiser** applications approved: Donna Sutherland. **Applications deferred:** None. **Applications denied:** None.
- 7.4 **Certified Residential Real Property Appraiser** applications approved: Jeremy Clark, Avery Duncan, Mark Faulconer (Recip)(FL), Donna Fernandes (Recip)(CA), Emily Free, Brandon Pilcher (Recip)(GA), and Joseph Ramirez (Recip)(TN). **Applications deferred:** None. **Applications denied:** Tyler Parr.
- 7.5 **Certified General Real Property Appraiser** applications approved: Elizabeth Broussard (Recip)(TX), Harold E. Campbell, Jr., (Recip)(MS), Barry A. Diskin (Recip)(FL), Jason Lopes (Recip)(TN), John Norris (Recip)(TX), Michael V. Tankersley (Recip)(TN), Kathleen Thrush (Recip)(OH), and Christopher M. Williams (Recip)(KS). **Applications deferred:** R. Jason Wright. **Applications denied:** None.
- 7.6 **Mentor** applications approved: Jeffrey L. Carter, Alexander McCall, and Bradley Pullum. **Application deferred:** Donald Shelton. **Applications denied:** None.
- 8.0 Mrs. Brooks presented the Finance report for June 2022-2023. Mrs. Brooks reported that the Board was 75% into Fiscal Year 2023 and 59% into budget expenditures and that there were no negative trends that could not be reconciled at this time.
- On motion by Mr. Haller and second by Mr. Butler, the Board voted to approve the Finance Report. Motion carried by unanimous vote.
- 9.0 On motion by Mr. Watson and second by Mr. Cotter, the following education courses and instructor recommendations on the July Education agenda were approved, deferred, or denied as indicated. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

## **APPRAISAL INSTITUTE – ALABAMA/MISSISSIPPI CHAPTER**

### **New Application:**

- (CE) Conservation Easements: 2023 Updates on Legal, Appraisal, Accounting & Ethical Issues – 5 Hours – Classroom  
(Instructors: Katherine Eddins, Ronald Levitt, Ken Davis, Lucas Von Esh, Lauren Roberts and Ormon Wilson)  
**Both Course and Instructors Approved**

## **APPRAISER ELEARNING, LLC**

### **New Applications:**

- (CE) Non-Lending Appraisals: Expanding Your Appraisal Practice – 7 Hours - Classroom  
(Instructor: Joshua Walitt)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Ultimate Workfile: What, When, Why – 4 Hours - Classroom  
(Instructor: Joshua Walitt)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

## **MCKISSOCK**

### **New Application:**

- (CE) GSE Appraisal Requirements and Guidelines – 7 Hours - Online  
(Instructor: Dan Bradley)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) Live Webinar: Residential Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach – 15 Hours - Online  
(Instructors: Dan Bradley, Diana Jacob, Greg Stephens, Josh Walitt, Mel Black, Pam Teel, Pat Kelly, Rob Abelson, Rob McClelland, and Sam Martin)  
**Both Course and Instructors Approved**
- (CE) VA Appraisal Requirements and Guidelines – 7 Hours - Online  
(Instructor: Dan Bradley)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

## **THE CE SHOP**

### **New Application:**

- (CE) 2022-2023 7-Hour National USPAP Update Course – 7 Hours - Online  
(Instructors: Rebecca Jones and Sam Martin)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

## **INSTRUCTOR APPROVAL ONLY**

- (CE) Live Webinar: Appraising Complex and Stigmatized Residential Properties – 7 Hours - Online  
(Instructor: Kevin Hecht)  
**Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Live Webinar: Appraising Condominium Units – 3 Hours - Online  
(Instructor: Kevin Hecht)  
**Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Live Webinar: Appraising Small Apartment Properties – 4 Hours - Online  
(Instructor: Kevin Hecht)  
**Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Live Webinar: Diversify Your Appraisal Practice with Estate Appraisals – 3 Hours - Online  
(Instructor: Kevin Hecht)  
**Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Live Webinar: Diversify Your Practice with Assessment Appeals – 4 Hours - Online  
(Instructor: Kevin Hecht)  
**Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Live Webinar: Fundamentals of Expert Witness Testimony – 4 Hours - Online  
(Instructor: Kevin Hecht)  
**Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Live Webinar: Land and Site Valuation – 5 Hours - Online  
(Instructor: Kevin Hecht)  
**Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Live Webinar: Measuring 1-4 Unit Residential Properties with ANSI Z765 Standard – 4 Hours - Online  
(Instructor: Kevin Hecht)  
**Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Live Webinar: New Construction Essentials: Luxury Homes – 3 Hours - Online  
(Instructor: Kevin Hecht)  
**Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Live Webinar: REO Appraisal Guidelines and Best Practices – 4 Hours - Online  
(Instructor: Kevin Hecht)  
**Instructor Approved**

- (CE) Live Webinar: Supporting Adjustments: The Journey from Analysis to Adjusting – 4 Hours - Online  
(Instructor: Kevin Hecht)  
**Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Live Webinar: The Appraiser's Guide to HUD Handbook 4000.1 – 7 Hours - Online  
(Instructor: Kevin Hecht)  
**Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Live Webinar: The Fundamentals of Appraising Luxury Homes – 4 Hours - Online  
(Instructor: Kevin Hecht)  
**Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Live Webinar: Valuation of Residential Solar – 3 Hours - Online  
(Instructor: Kevin Hecht)  
**Instructor Approved**

Ms. Conway noted that the Fair Housing Course will be required beginning January 2024, therefore it will be required for renewal as part of the twenty-eight required hours of continuing education due by September 30, 2025.

- 10.0 **AB 23-39** On May 18, 2023, the Board approved a consent settlement with a Certified Residential Real Property Appraiser Max Milton, R00541 where the Licensee agreed to pay a \$375 Administrative Fine. The Violations in the report are: For the Sales Comparison Approach, there is no support for the land value or site adjustment, there is no support for the room count adjustment, there is no support for the garage/carport adjustment, there is no support for the attic room adjustment. The subject property was currently under contract dated, 6/13/21 for \$287,600. The sale was not analyzed taking into consideration, price history or any changes, days on the market, or any history concerning the subject The appraisal lacks discussion and explanation for adjustments in the sales comparison approach and a summary of the analysis of the contract. **Record Keeping Rule, Standard Rule 1-5, 2-2 (3), USPAP, 2020-2021 Edition.**

Ms. Conway discussed with the Board the investigative status charts. Ms. Conway reported that 10 new Appraiser complaints and no new Appraisal Management Company (AMC) complaints were received since the May 2023 Board meeting, 12 complaints were dismissed, and 1 complaint was settled, leaving a total of 39 open complaints.

- 11.0 The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-22-20**: With Mrs. Housh and Mr. Anderson recusing, on motion by Mr. Butler and second by Mr. Haller, the Board voted that probable cause does not exist and to issue a Letter of Counsel. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-22-23**: With Mrs. Housh and Mr. Anderson recusing, on motion by Mr. Haller and second by Mr. Cotter, the Board voted that probable cause does not exist and to issue a Letter of Counsel. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-22-37**: With Mrs. Housh recusing, on motion by Mr. Haller and second by Mr. Cotter, the Board voted that probable cause does not exist and to issue a Letter of Counsel. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-22-38**: With Mr. Haller recusing, on motion by Mr. Butler and second by Mrs. Housh, the Board voted that probable cause does not exist and to offer the appraiser a Conditional Dismissal. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-23-07**: With Mr. Haller recusing, on motion by Mr. Watson and second by Mrs. Housh, the Board voted that probable cause does not exist and to dismiss this case. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-23-12**: With Mrs. Housh recusing, on motion by Mr. Watson and second by Mr. Cotter, the Board voted that probable cause does not exist and to dismiss this case. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-23-13**: With Mrs. Housh recusing, on motion by Mr. Watson and second by Mr. Cotter, the Board voted that probable cause does not exist and to dismiss this case. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-23-14**: With Mr. Haller recusing, on motion by Mrs. Housh and second by Mr. Cotter, the Board voted that probable cause does not exist and to dismiss this case. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-23-15**: With Mrs. Housh recusing, on motion by Mr. Haller and second by Mr. Butler, the Board voted that probable cause does not exist and to dismiss this case. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-23-16**: With Mrs. Housh recusing, on motion by Mr. Haller and second by Mr. Butler, the Board voted that probable cause does not exist and to dismiss this case. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-23-17**: With Mr. Haller recusing, on motion by Mrs. Housh and second by Mr. Cotter, the Board voted that probable cause does not exist and to dismiss this case. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

- 13.0 The following reciprocal licenses were issued since the May Board meeting: Elizabeth Broussard ('G' TX), Harold E. Campbell, Jr. ('G' MS), Barry A. Diskin ('G' FL), Mark Faulconer ('R' FL), Donna Fernandes ('R' CA), Jason Lopes ('G' TN), John Norris ('G' TX), Brandon Pilcher ('R' GA), Joseph Ramirez ('R' TN), Michael V. Tankersley ('G' TN), Kathleen Thrash ('G' OH), and Christopher M. Williams ('G' KS).
- 14.0 The Temporary Permit report was provided to the Board for their information.
- 15.0 The Appraisal Management report was provided to the Board for their information.
- 16.0 Mrs. Brooks discussed the Fall AARO conference and asked that Board members let her know if they are interested in attending.
- Mrs. Brooks provided the RSA Union office space lease renewal for Board information.
- After discussion regarding the Board meeting dates, the Board decided to move the meetings to the 2<sup>nd</sup> Thursday of every other month when possible.
- Mrs. Brooks discussed the upcoming Joint Interim Sunset Committee Meeting scheduled for Thursday, August 24, 2023, at 1:00 pm with the Board. Mrs. Brooks also stressed that the Committee encourages Board member attendance at the meeting.
- 17.0 Ms. Conway discussed the new Investigator position. She informed the Board that Mr. Nathan Stephens had been interviewed and that she was in the process of negotiations with him.
- 18.0 Mr. Butler discussed reconsideration of the Board's decision to deny Mr. Victor Smith's request for additional time to take his upgrade exam. After much discussion, Mr. Butler made a motion to grant Mr. Smith 30 days to take the exam. There was no second. The motion died.
- Mr. Butler asked staff to obtain the gender and race of all appraisers for him.
- 19.0 At 11:41 a.m., on motion by Mr. Haller and second by Mr. Cotter, the Board voted to adjourn the regular Board meeting. Motion carried by unanimous vote. The Board's tentative meeting schedule for 2023 is, September 21<sup>st</sup>, and November 9<sup>th</sup>, held in the RSA Union 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor Conference Room, 100 Union Street, Montgomery, AL 36104.



Sincerely,



Carolyn Greene  
Executive Secretary  
/cg

**APPROVED:** Chad Anderson  
Chad Anderson, Chairman

**Signature:** Chad Anderson  
Chad Anderson (Sep 26, 2023 15:52 CDT)

**Email:** chad@andersonag.com






# MINUTES07-13-23 final

Final Audit Report

2023-09-26

Created:	2023-09-21
By:	Carolyn Greene (carolyn.greene@reab.alabama.gov)
Status:	Signed
Transaction ID:	CBJCHBCAABAAGlboYnjAk4aPPLYj8WID8kS4fnydwDpB

## "MINUTES07-13-23 final" History

-  Document created by Carolyn Greene (carolyn.greene@reab.alabama.gov)  
2023-09-21 - 6:21:44 PM GMT - IP address: 216.226.188.47
-  Document emailed to chad@andersonag.com for signature  
2023-09-21 - 6:22:20 PM GMT
-  Email viewed by chad@andersonag.com  
2023-09-26 - 8:52:15 PM GMT - IP address: 69.246.172.218
-  Signer chad@andersonag.com entered name at signing as Chad Anderson  
2023-09-26 - 8:52:42 PM GMT - IP address: 69.246.172.218
-  Document e-signed by Chad Anderson (chad@andersonag.com)  
Signature Date: 2023-09-26 - 8:52:44 PM GMT - Time Source: server- IP address: 69.246.172.218
-  Agreement completed.  
2023-09-26 - 8:52:44 PM GMT



State of  
Alabama

Powered by  
**Adobe**  
Acrobat Sign