MINUTES ALABAMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS BOARD RSA UNION STREET SUITE 370 MONTGOMERY, AL 36104 July 11, 2024

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Mr. Chad Anderson (Chairman)

Mr. Roger Ball

Mr. Drew Watson

Mr. Randall Kyles

Mr. Mark Palmer

Mr. Bill Mackey

MEMBERS ABSENT:

Mrs. Melanie Housh (Vice-Chairman)

Mr. Timothy Mills

Mr. A.J. Smith

STAFF PRESENT:

Mrs. Lisa Brooks, Executive Director Ms. Neva Conway, Legal Counsel Mrs. Carolyn Greene, Executive Secretary Mr. Jimmy Green, Investigator

STAFF ABSENT:

None

GUESTS PRESENT:

Mr. Palmer Byrne, Trainee Real Property Appraiser.

- 1.0 Mr. Chad Anderson, Chairman, called the meeting to order at 9:11 a.m. Mrs. Carolyn Greene, Executive Secretary, recorded the minutes. The meeting was held in Suite 300 Conference Room of the RSA Union Building, 100 N. Union Street, Montgomery, Alabama. Prior notice of the meeting was posted on the Secretary of State's website on November 13, 2023, in accordance with the Alabama Open Meetings Act.
- 2.0 The meeting was opened with prayer led by Mr. Anderson and the Pledge of Allegiance, led by Mr. Ball.
- 3.0 Mr. Anderson asked Mrs. Greene to call a voice roll to establish a quorum. Board members present were Mr. Chad Anderson, Mr. Roger Ball, Mr. Bill Mackey, Mr. Randall Kyles, Mr. Drew Watson, and Mr. Mark Palmer. Members absent were Mrs. Melanie Housh, Mr. Tim Mills, and Mr. A. J. Smith. A quorum was established.

Mr. Anderson welcomed the guest, Mr. Palmer Byrne, and asked him to introduce himself.

- 4.0 On motion by Mr. Kyles and second by Mr. Mackey, the regular minutes for June 13, 2024, were approved as written. Motion carried by unanimous vote.
- 5.0 Ms. Conway stated that there is nothing to report on the two lawsuits related to REAB.
- 6.0 There was no Legislative report to discuss at this time.
- 7.0 On motion by Mr. Mackey and second by Mr. Ball, the Board voted to deny the Mentor application submitted by Mr. Ronald Holyfield. Mr. Anderson and Mr. Watson recused. Motion carried.

On motion by Mr. Ball and second by Mr. Kyles, the following applications were voted on as listed. Motion carried.

- 7.1 <u>Trainee Real Property Appraiser</u> applications approved: None. Applications approved: None.
- 7.2 <u>State Registered Real Property Appraiser</u> applications approved: None. Applications deferred: None. Applications denied: None.
- 7.3 <u>Licensed Real Property Appraiser</u> applications approved: None. **Applications deferred:** None. **Applications denied:** None.
- 7.4 <u>Certified Residential Real Property Appraiser</u> applications approved: Palmer Byrne, Michael Murphree, and Daniel Tyler. **Applications deferred:** None. **Applications denied:** None.
- 7.5 <u>Certified General Real Property Appraiser</u> application approved: Brett Suszek (Recip)(MI). Applications deferred: None. Applications denied: None.
- 7.6 <u>Mentor</u> applications approved: None. Application deferred: None. Applications denied: Ronald Holyfield.
- 7.7 <u>Trainee Real Property Appraiser Experience Logs for Review:</u> Logs reviewed: None. Log Reviews deferred: None.
- 8.0 Mr. Watson and Mrs. Brooks presented the Finance report for June 2023-2024, reported that the Board was 75% into Fiscal Year 2024 and 53% into budget expenditures and that there were no negative trends that could not be reconciled at this time.

On motion by Mr. Mackey and second by Mr. Ball, the Board voted to approve the Finance Report. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

9.0 On motion by Mr. Mackey and second by Mr. Palmer, the following education courses and instructor recommendations on the July Education agenda were approved, deferred, or denied as indicated. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

APPRAISAL INSTITUTE - CHICAGO CHAPTER

New Application:

(CE) Impact of Short-term Rentals (on Real Property Valuation) – 7 Hours
 - Classroom
 (Instructor: Jason Ferris)
 Both Course and instructor Approved

MCKISSOCK LP

New Applications:

- (CE) Cracking the Code-Demystifying Desktop and Hybrid Appraisals 3 Hours Classroom (Instructors: Alan Hummel, Alex Gilbert, Charles Fisher, Charles Huntoon, Dan Bone, Dan Bradley, Dan Tosh, Greg Stephens, Howard Kanter, Josh Walitt, Julie Floyd, Kevin Hecht, Larry McMillen, Mel Black, Pamela Teel, Rob Frazier, Rob Luciani, Steve Maher, Tony Pistilli, and Wally Czekalski)

 Both Course and Instructors Approved
- (CE) Live Webinar: Cracking the Code-Demystifying Desktop and Hybrid Appraisals 3 Hours Online (Instructors: Alan Hummel, Alex Gilbert, Charles Fisher, Charles Huntoon, Dan Bradley, Diana Jacob, Greg Stephens, Jo Traut, Josh Walitt, Julie Floyd, Kevin-Hecht, Mel-Black, Pamela-Teel, Philicia Lloyd, Rob Abelson, Rob Frazier, Rob McClelland, and Steve Maher)

 Both Course and Instructors Approved
- 10.0 There was no Disciplinary Report to review at this time.

Ms. Conway discussed with the Board the investigative status charts. Ms. Conway reported that 5 new Appraiser complaints and no new Appraisal Management Company (AMC) complaints were received since the June 2024 Board meeting, 10 complaints were dismissed, and no complaints were settled, leaving a total of 27 open complaints.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-23-55**: On motion by Mr. Ball and second by Mr. Mackey, the Board voted that probable cause does not exist and to issue a Letter of Counsel. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report AB-23-57: On motion by Mr. Mackey and second by Mr. Ball, the Board voted that probable cause does exist and to issue a Letter of Warning. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report AB-23-60: With Mr. Ball recusing, on motion by Mr. Kyles and second by Mr. Palmer, the Board voted that probable cause does not exist and to issue a Letter of Counsel. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

- 12.0 There were no Consent Settlement Orders to review at this time.
- The following reciprocal license was issued since the June Board meeting: Brett Suszek ('G' Mi).
- 14.0 The Temporary Permit report was provided to the Board for their information.
- 15.0 The Appraisal Management report was provided to the Board for their information.
- Ms. Conway discussed the changes to the Administrative Rules necessary for PAREA adoption. She also included an email from Mr. Scott DiBiasio, Director, Government Affairs, Appraisal Institute, and letter from the Appraisal Institute including written comments regarding the Notices of Intended Action to amend several of the Real Estate Appraisers Board's regulations that were published in the Alabama Administrative Monthly on April 30, 2024.

The Board discussed allowing 50% of the residential component of the experience log to include non-traditional appraisals that may not require an internal inspection. A category will be added to the Experience Handbook for appraisals without an internal inspection. A maximum of 7.5 hours will be allowed for these appraisals.

Mr. Watson discussed the roadmap/timeline to licensure.

The Trainee Experience Log Review requirement discussion was deferred to the September Board meeting.

The Board discussed a request from Mrs. Savannah James for an extension of her Trainee exam eligibility period. On motion by Mr. Mackey and second by Mr. Palmer, the Board voted to deny Mrs. James' request for an extension and to give her instructions for reapplication for approval to take the Trainee exam. Mr. Watson opposed the motion. Motion carried.

17.0 Ms. Conway presented three responses to the Request for Proposal of a contract to conduct evaluation of appraisal work product for USPAP and state law compliance in appraiser credential upgrade applications for the Alabama Real Estate Appraisers Board.

On motion by Mr. Watson and second by Mr. Mackey, the Board voted to contract with Mr. Walitt and Ms. Alley for the review of Trainee Experience Log Review, Upgrade and Supervisor application samples. The motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board discussed the existing way that applicant appraisal work product is reviewed by individual board members and how inconsistent the process is. On motion by Mr. Ball and second by Mr. Kyles, the Board voted to send the review of Trainee Experience Log Review, Upgrade and Supervisor application samples to reviewers. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

18.0 There was no new business to discuss at this time.

At 12:19 p.m., on motion by Mr. Watson and second by Mr. Anderson, the Board voted to adjourn the regular Board meeting. Motion carried by unanimous vote. The Board's tentative meeting schedule for 2024 is September 12th, and November 14th, held in the RSA Union 3rd Floor Conference Room, 100 Union Street, Montgomery, AL 36104.

Sincerely,

Carolyn Greene Executive Secretary

Carol or Greene

/cg

APPROVED:

Chad Anderson, Chairman