

MINUTES
ALABAMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS BOARD
RSA UNION STREET
SUITE 370
MONTGOMERY, AL 36104
May 8, 2025

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Mr. Chad Anderson (Chairman)
Mrs. Melanie Housh (Vice-Chairman)
Mr. Timothy Mills
Mr. Randall Kyles
Mr. Mark Palmer
Mr. Bill Mackey

MEMBERS ABSENT:

Mr. A.J. Smith
Mr. Roger Ball
Mr. Drew Watson

STAFF PRESENT:

Mrs. Lisa Brooks, Executive Director
Ms. Neva Conway, Legal Counsel
Mrs. Carolyn Greene, Executive Secretary
Mr. Jimmy Green, Investigator

GUESTS PRESENT:

Mr. Pete Fontana, Montana Board of Real Estate Appraisers
Mr. Josh Tanner, Certified Residential Appraiser, Mobile, AL

- 1.0 Mr. Chad Anderson, Chairman, called the meeting to order at 9:02 a.m. Mrs. Carolyn Greene, Executive Secretary, recorded the minutes. The meeting was held in Suite 300 Conference Room of the RSA Union Building, 100 N. Union Street, Montgomery, Alabama. Prior notice of the meeting was posted on the Secretary of State's website on December 31, 2024, in accordance with the Alabama Open Meetings Act.
- 2.0 The meeting was opened with prayer by Mr. Mills and the Pledge of Allegiance led by Mrs. Housh.
- 3.0 Mr. Anderson asked for a voice roll to establish a quorum. Board members present were Mr. Chad Anderson, Mr. Bill Mackey, Mr. Randall Kyles, Mr. Tim Mills, Mrs. Melanie Housh, and Mr. Mark Palmer. Mr. A. J. Smith, Mr. Drew Watson, and Mr. Roger Ball were not in attendance. A quorum was established.
- 4.0 On motion by Mr. Mills and second by Mr. Kyles the regular minutes for March 13, 2025 were approved as written. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

- 5.0 Ms. Conway informed the Board that Mr. Cleabron Pullum has entered a request for judicial review in Limestone County.
- 6.0 Ms. Conway presented proposed amendments to the Administrative Code 780-X-3 Applications for Licensure and Certification; 780-X-5 – Curricula Approved by The Board; 780-X-12 – Expirations, Renewals and Continuing Education; and 780-X-18 – Appraisal Management Company Forms. On motion by Mr. Anderson and Mr. Mills, the Board voted to approve the proposed amendments
- Ms. Conway notified the Board that PAREA would be in place on May 15, 2025.
- 7.0 On motion by Mr. Kyles and second by Mr. Mills, the following applications were voted on as listed. Motion carried.
- 7.1 **Trainee Real Property Appraiser applications approved:** Joseph Pace. **Applications deferred:** None. **Applications denied:** None.
- 7.2 **State Registered Real Property Appraiser applications approved:** None. **Applications deferred:** None. **Applications denied:** None.
- 7.3 **Licensed Real Property Appraiser applications approved:** John Howard Haynie, William Roscoe Shamblin, and Kenneth M. Spencer II (Recip)(GA). **Applications deferred:** None. **Applications denied:** None.
- 7.4 **Certified Residential Real Property Appraiser applications approved:** Tiffany Arnold. **Applications deferred:** Wilson McDonald. **Applications denied:** None.
- 7.5 **Certified General Real Property Appraiser application approved:** Evan Abramowitz (Recip)(NC), Eric Q. Carson (Recip)(GA), David Matthew Chudzik (Recip)(WA), Gabriel Erwin (Recip)(FL), Hunter Holland (Recip)(TN), Samuel Levi (Recip)(NJ), Eric Mees (Recip)(GA), Patrick Phipps (Recip)(FL), Jacob Sieve (Recip)(MN), Deanna DeFoor Thomas (Recip)(GA), and Joshua Ward (Recip)(NC). **Applications deferred:** None. **Applications denied:** None.
- 7.6 **Mentor applications approved:** Eugene Kenyon Owen and Jennifer Spears. **Application deferred:** None. **Applications denied:** None.
- Trainee Real Property Appraiser Experience Logs for Review: Logs reviewed:** Marlon Brian Long, Stone McCurry and Olivia Shea Pope. **Log Reviews deferred:** None.
- 8.0 Mrs. Brooks presented the Finance report for April 2024-2025. She reported that the Board was 59% into Fiscal Year 2025 and 38% into budget expenditures and that there were no negative trends that could not be reconciled at this time.

On motion by Mr. Mills and second by Mr. Palmer, the Board voted to approve the Finance Report. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

9.0

On motion by Mr. Mills and second by Mrs. Housh, the following education courses and instructor recommendations on the March Education agenda were approved, deferred, or denied as indicated. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

APPRAISAL INSTITUTE – AL/MS

New Application:

- (CE) Supporting Appraisal Adjustments – 7 Hours - Classroom
(Instructor: Jason Tillema)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

APPRAISAL INSTITUTE – CHICAGO

New Application:

- (CE) 2024-2025 7-Hour Equivalent USPAP Update Course – 7 Hours -
Online
(Instructors: Brett Hall and Craig Harrington)
Both Course and Instructors Approved

APPRAISER ELEARNING LLC

New Applications:

- (CE) Staying Out of the Courtroom Unless You're Being Paid to be There
– 2 Hours - Classroom
(Instructor: Peter Christensen)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Understanding the Role of Collateral Underwriter – 4 Hours -
Classroom
(Instructor: Martin Wagar)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

CALYPSO CONTINUING EDUCATION

New Application:

- (CE) Mold a Growing Concern - 4 Hours- Online (Instructor: Francis Finigan)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

MCKISSOCK LP
New Applications:

(CE) Live Webinar: Scope of Work and the New URAR - 4 Hour s- Online
(Instructors: Alan Hummel, Alexander Gilbert, Charles Fisher, Charles Huntoon, Dan Bradley, Diana Jacob, Greg Stephens, Jo Traut, Josh Walitt, Julie Floyd, Kevin Hecht, Mel Black, Pamela Teel, Philicia Lloyd, Rob Abelson, Robert Frazier, Rob McClelland and Steve Maher)
Both Course and Instructors Approved

(CE) Scope of Work and the New URAR - 4 Hours - Classroom
(Instructors: Alan Hummel, Alexander Gilbert, Charles Fisher, Charles Huntoon, Dan Bone, Dan Bradley, Dan Tosh, Greg Stephens, Howard Kanter, Josh Walitt, Julie Floyd, Kevin Hecht, Mel Black, Pamela Teel, Robert Frazier, Robert Luciani, Steve Maher, Tony Pistilli and Wally Czekalski)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

(CE) The Appraiser's Guide to the New URAR - 7 Hour s- Online
(Instructor: Jo Traut)
Both Course and Instructors Approved

INSTRUCTOR APPROVAL ONLY

(CE) Business Practices and Ethics – 6 Hours - Classroom
(Instructor: Jacinto Munoz)
Instructor Approved

(CE) Online Business Practices and Ethics – 6 Hours - Online
(Instructor: Steven Shockley)
Instructor Approved

(LIC) Online General Appraiser Income Approach Part 2 – 30 Hours - Online
(Instructor: David Lennhoff)
Instructor Approved

(LIC) Online Residential Site Valuation and Cost Approach – 15 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Edward Molinari)
Instructor Approved

(CE) Online Business Practices and Ethics – 6 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Richard Borges)
Instructor Approved

(CE) Online Comparative Analysis – 7 Hours - Online
(Instructor: Richard Borges)
Instructor Approved

- (CE) 2024-2025 7-Hour National USPAP Update Course – 7 Hours - Classroom
(Instructor: Brian Flynn)
Instructor Approved
- (CE) Case Studies in Appraising Green Residential Buildings – 7 Hours - Classroom
(Instructor: Lisa Meinczinger)
Instructor Approved
- (CE) Appraiser's Guide to the New URAR – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Lisa Meinczinger)
Instructor Approved
- (CE) Online Appraising Condos, Co-Ops, and PUDs – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Maureen Sweeney)
Instructor Approved

10.0 There was no disciplinary report to discuss at this time.

Ms. Conway discussed with the Board the investigative status charts. Ms. Conway reported that 2 new Appraiser complaints and no new Appraisal Management Company (AMC) complaints were received since the March 2025 Board meeting, 2 complaints were dismissed, and no complaints were settled, leaving a total of 25 open complaints.

11.0 The Board carried Probable Cause Report **AB-24-10** over to the July Board meeting.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-24-21**: With Mr. Anderson and Mrs. Housh recusing, on motion by Mr. Mills and second by Mr. Kyles, the Board voted that probable cause does exist and to set this case for a hearing. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-24-22**: With Mr. Anderson and Mrs. Housh recusing, on motion by Mr. Mills and second by Mr. Palmer, the Board voted that probable cause does exist and to set this case for a hearing. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-24-23**: With Mr. Anderson and Mrs. Housh recusing, on motion by Mr. Mills and second by Mr. Kyles, the Board voted that probable cause does exist and to set this case for a hearing. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-24-24**: With Mr. Anderson and Mrs. Housh recusing, on motion by Mr. Mills and second by Mr. Palmer, the Board voted that probable cause does exist and to set this case for a hearing. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-24-36**: With Mrs. Housh recusing, on motion by Mr. Mills and second by Mr. Palmer, the Board voted that probable cause does not exist and to issue a Letter of Counsel. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-24-40**: On motion by Mr. Mills and second by Mr. Kyles, the Board voted that probable cause does not exist and to dismiss this case. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-25-01**: On motion by Mr. Mills and second by Mr. Palmer, the Board voted that probable cause does not exist and to dismiss this case. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-25-03**: With Mrs. Housh recusing, on motion by Mr. Mills and second by Mr. Palmer, the Board voted that probable cause does not exist and to dismiss this case. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

- 12.0 There were no Consent Settlement Orders to review at this time.
- 13.0 The following reciprocal license was issued since the March Board meeting: Evan Abramowitz (G)(NC), Eric Q. Carson (G)(GA), David Matthew Chudzik (G)(WA), Hunter Holland (G)(TN), Samuel Levi (G)(NJ), Eric Mees (G)(GA), Patrick Phipps (G)(FL), Jacob Sieve (G)(MN), Kenneth M. Spencer, II (L)(GA), Deanna DeFoor Thomas (G)(GA), and Joshua Ward (G)(NC).
- 14.0 The Temporary Permit report was provided to the Board for their information.
- 15.0 The Appraisal Management report was provided to the Board for their information.
- 16.0 Mrs. Brooks discussed the Appraisal Subcommittee (ASC) Compliance Review final report of the Alabama appraiser regulatory program (Appraiser Program) which was completed on December 5, 2024. The report reflected that the Board must require continuing education from all appraisers every two years to include reciprocal licensees.
- Mrs. Brooks relayed a voicemail from Joe Batrich regarding reserve studies for Board information.
- Mrs. Brooks discussed a request from Trainee Real Property Appraiser Valerie Spicuzza for an experience credit determination on 3 appraisals. Mrs. Housh reviewed the appraisals and recommended that the Board grant 90 hours for the mini-storage appraisal, 90 hours for the boat storage appraisal and 40 hours for the mobile home park appraisal. On motion by Mr. Mills and second by Mr. Kyles, the board voted to accept Mrs. Housh's recommendation. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

Mrs. Brooks presented an email from Mr. Michael Tyk regarding Certified Residential appraisers doing short term rental analysis for residential properties. Mrs. Greene will reply to Mr. Tyk with the Competency Rule of USPAP and the Certified Residential statute.

Mrs. Brooks presented an email from Kristen Magnussen, a Certified General Real Property Appraiser in California, Utah, South Dakota and West Virginia. Ms. Magnussen currently provides desktop residential appraisals to Appraisal Management Companies in those states that rely on a third-party inspection report rather than a personal inspection, and she is investigating taking on some trainees who would be allowed to gain experience with these types of assignments. Ms. Conway stated that as of May 15, 2025, Trainees must supply a plan to the Board of how they will be supervised when not working out of their supervisor's office. Ms. Conway and Mrs. Brooks will respond to Ms. Magnussen.

Mrs. Brooks informed the Board that Margaret Anne Davis had submitted her unofficial resignation. Mrs. Brooks discussed hiring someone to replace Mrs. Davis and stated that the new hire will be either a paralegal or ASA II full-time position, and that she will have to go through State Personnel. Mrs. Brooks also stated that there will not be a need for a clerk with this position being filled.

- 17.0 Mrs. Conway discussed the contract for the Review Appraiser and is sending appraisals to the candidates for review.

Ms. Conway informed the Board that she had requested a salary review from State Personnel for the Executive Director position but has not received a response to date.

- 18.0 Mrs. Housh asked about the certification statement. Ms. Conway will research and report back to the Board.

Mr. Pete Fontana of the Montana Board of Real Estate Appraisers, spoke to the Board about expanding experience credit options for applicants.

- 19.0 At 11:33 a.m., on motion by Mr. Mills and second by Mr. Palmer, the Board voted to adjourn the regular Board meeting. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board's tentative meeting schedule for 2025 is July 10, 2025, September 11, 2025, and November 13, 2025, held in the RSA Union 3rd Floor Conference Room, 100 Union Street, Montgomery, AL 36104.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Carolyn Greene". The script is cursive and fluid.

Carolyn Greene Executive Secretary
/cg

APPROVED:

Chad Anderson, Chairman

A handwritten signature in blue ink that appears to read "Chad Anderson". The script is cursive and stylized.